EQUIMOB meeting minutes

Date: 16/12/2020

Time: 10-12 AM CET; 3-5 PM in Bangladesh and 2:30-4:30 PM in India

Participants:

Prof. Ajay Bailey (PI)
Professor dr. Dick Ettema (Co-PI)
Dr. Marco Helbich (Co-PI)
Dr. Martin Hyde (Advisor, Swansea University)
Prof. Md. Musleh Uddin Hasan (Co-PI)
Dr. Shanawez Hossain (Co-PI)
Dr. Lekha Subaiya (Co-PI)
Dr. Sobin George (Co-PI)
Maheen Sultan (BIGD)
Prof. Sanghamitra Roy (PhD, MAHE-UU)
Saakshi Joshi (Postdoc, Delhi)
Selim jahangir (Postdoc, Dhaka)
Divya Sussana Patil (PhD, MAHE)
Prajwal Nagesh (PhD, ISEC-UU)
Seama Mowri (PhD UU)

Agenda: This meeting intends to present an update on the research activities carried out in 2019-2020 and plans of action for the next year. So the agenda was divided into three sections:

Meeting:

The meeting started with a general introduction of participants.

Prof. Ajay Bailey began with a brief overview of the project and a summary of collective progress from all three field sites. He elaborated on the objectives and insights of the project so far: (i) mapping of physical and social barriers; (ii) extensive research among older adults and women; (iii) barriers for people with disabilities still to be developed

Prof Bailey highlighted the important achievements of the project to be:

- State of art review papers on transport barriers in Delhi, Bengaluru and Dhaka
- Collaborations with NGOs to enhance the co-creation possibilities
- Pre-COVID-19 data collection from Dhaka, Delhi and Bengaluru

He then discussed the impact of COVID-19 on the project activities, noting that all fieldwork had to be postponed, but the team adapted by designing an online survey for both Bangladesh

and India and have engaged in developing a range of research outputs such as Infographics, newspaper op-eds and book chapters from the survey results.

The major outputs from the project so far are:

a. Journal articles (2 published 4 under review)
b. Book chapters (1 accepted, 3 under review)
c. Infographics (5 from India and Bangladesh)
d. Capacity building (workshops, lectures and teaching)
e. Op-eds (5 articles published)
f. Knowledge exchange events

At this point, research teams from all three project sites presented their updates. A summary of the presentations is as follows.

	Delhi	Bangalore	Dhaka
Work so far	• Research fieldwork: Visual survey; In-depth interviews and analysis • Online survey: Translation, launch, participant recruitment, analysis • Published a paper in the transport policy journal • Another manuscript ready for submission	• Data collection in February 2020 (17 IDIs, 12 visual surveys) • Analysis of data • Due to COVID-19 lockdown telephonic interviews were conducted in June/July (60 interviews, transcription is going on) • Completed screening of articles for realist review; currently data extraction is going on.	**Empirical research:** - 30 in-depth Interviews with Older adults [Lalbagh and Rayer Bazar neighbourhoods] - 12 interviews with rickshaw pullers, auto-rickshaw and CNG drivers - Visual surveys - Online survey of 221 participants to understand COVID-induced mobility patterns **Secondary review**: - Qualitative Systematic Review of safety interventions for women in South Asia
Outputs	• **Delhi Citylab** workshop in collaboration with University of Delhi • Lecture on '*Gender Inclusive Urban Public Transport in India*' • Infographics from online survey data • Panel discussion on Covid-19 and health care disparities • Knowledge exchange between researchers	A **protocol for realist synthesis** review has been published in systematic review journal A book chapter accepted for policy press edited book Submitted a book chapter on '*mental wellbeing of older adults and access to healthcare during Covid-19*' for springer Submitted an article on '*social and political*	**Knowledge Exchange** - *Meaningful Mobility* Team from the University of Groningen on collaboration opportunities [Ecological Momentary Assessment (EMA] - Knowledge Exchange Event with researchers (Dhaka Univ, UK and Canada) and urban planners

- from Meaningful Mobility project • First draft of manuscript on impact of COVID-19 on older adults mobility • Two blogs published in Dow to Earth	*challenges to incorporating transport equity'* to Transport Research Part D. Designed Infographics on 'older adults mobility during COVID-19 in India', 'Mental well-being of older adults' and 'risk perception regarding COVID-19' **Capacity building:** Courses on research & publication ethics Certificate course on Qualitative research methods Certificate course on research methodology Responsible conduct of research Research writing for scientists **Conferences:** Presented a paper on 'transport disadvantage: understanding ageing and mobility in the peripheral Bengaluru' in 13th international conference Transportation Planning and implementation methodologies for developing countries 10-12 Dec, 2020. **Op-eds:** Bus travel in times of COVID: How BMTC can accommodate senior citizens – Prajwal N, Ajay Bailey Published by Citizen Matters in August 2020. It's high time BMTC got people with disabilities on board. Here are five steps to ensure this – Euan Morrison, Prajwal N, Ajay Bailey Published by Citizen Matters in September 2020. **Teaching:** Lecture on 'Introduction to systematic reviews' for advanced methods and techniques at UU Short lecture on 'Conceptual framework' at MAHE	**Panel Discussion**: COVID-19 and health care disparities case studies from India and Bangladesh **Conference**: Presented on women's equitable access to public transport in Bangladesh in **Sustainability and Inclusive Global Mobility Initiative (SIGMI) Conference 2020**, organized by TU Berlin **Op-eds** - COVID-19 lockdowns: A test for the mental well-being of older adults, The Financial Express, published on Dec 7, 2020 - How are older adults in Bangladesh coping with mobility restrictions? The Business Standard, Dec 7 2020. **Book Chapters** - A book chapter submitted to an edited book on 'Older People and COVID 19: Impact of the Pandemic'. - Submitted an abstract for a proposed edited book Handbook on ageing **Journal Articles** A review paper has been submitted to the journal 'Case Studies on Transport Policy'. Submitted a paper on 'visibility matters….constructing safe passages' to Urban Geography. - Based on field data another paper on barriers to access bus is ready to submit in the journal. The first draft of a joint paper on the impact of Covid-19 on mobility and mental well-being of older adults in India and Bangladesh

		Presentation on the experiences of conducting an online survey for UU students	
		Stakeholder Engagements: Bengaluru Bus Prayanikara Vedike (BBPV), and The Energy and Resource Institute (TERI)-consulted for inputs while designing the tools. HelpAge India, AIKYA, FEDINA, Hasirudala NGO- for fieldwork Mobility India, The Association of People with Disability, District Disability Rehabilitation Centre Smart cities mission, Bengaluru team- yet to obtain a letter of permission Infographics and research publications have been constantly shared with local stakeholders.	
Upcoming works	Story completion method to understand women's perception about travel by Delhi metro EQUIMOB YouTube channel	• Stakeholder inputs for the realist review and completion of the realist review by February 2021 • Transcription and analysis of the telephonic interview. • Collaboration with meaningful mobility team from the University of Groningen • Resume fieldwork once the COVID-19 situation is in control • Writing blogs	**Capacity Building Workshops** - Visual survey workshop and training [Jan 2020] - Policy Brief & The Conversation writing workshops [Jan 2021] - Research Writing I [Feb-April 2021] - Research Ethics Course [2021] **Research** - Analysis of existing data sets (BRAC) - Media Review of women's safety - Primary data collection [IDIs, FGDs, GIS data mapping & geo-narratives, KIIs, visual methods] **Writing** 2 papers based on field data (Q1 2021)

			- Unequal access to public transport and social exclusion of older adults in Dhaka - Risk perception and safety issues of older adults accessing public transport in Dhaka **Knowledge Sharing** - Design of 3 infographics depicting survey findings for dissemination on social media, newspapers and website - Meeting with Dhaka Transport Corporation [Jan 2021] - Paper presentation at Urban ARC conference, Indian Institute for Human Settlements [Jan 2021] - Presentation of paper in an international conference, IGU [Aug 2021]

Key Comments and Suggestions: After the presentation from the three teams, the discussion was opened among all the attendees for their opinions and suggestions.

- Dr. Marco Heblich offered to train EQUIMOB researchers about the with GPS tools and the way to measure stress levels (using wearables). **Ajay:** In January we can have a short meeting to look at the method and then a make a plan how can it be implemented in the coming year.

- **Prof Dick Ettema:** We can publish some papers on the special issue in Transport journal from different teams. Think along the lines of 'what can the North learn from the South'? Since the project has different geographical outreach it would be really good to approach transport journals or transport policy-oriented journals.

- **Dr. Hyde Martin:** COVID-19 has brought drastic changes. Increase in ageist language and older adults perceived further marginalized since all efforts are on re-employing youth. It also influenced the transport and mobility; I can see that in Infographics. From data, we can see huge emigration from the cities to the countryside. People perceived cities to be more vulnerable. Do older adults want to move back to villages? Shift towards localism? Motorcycle taxis in Thailand. Impact on new policies can also be seen.

Maheen Sultan: Infographics are impressive. What is the strategy to use these Infographics? We can use the online survey data for disseminating knowledge in Bangladesh. We want to involve Mowri and Selim in BIGD activities. We need more training in research writing workshop for capacity building.

Prof. Musleh Uddin Hasan: Waterways have conventionally been missing from many transport research. Waterways are important links in Dhaka. Can we include that in our EQUIMOB project? Has NMT survived pandemic? Or resurrected during this pandemic situation? We can use online data for regional comparison. The cities are of different sizes and perform differently. How people coped in these different cities? Can we include local/regional publishers for our research works? So that local people can access easily and will come to know about our activities.

EQUIMOB Research focus on disability and disabled groups

Dr. Marco: there are organisations which are working on both the hidden and visible disability. We can approach them for research collaboration.

Dr. Sobin George: Have recently worked on a research project focused on Tuberculosis. It has data from 188 participants. Suggested to have follow-up interviews for EQUIMOB interviews conducted during the COVID-19 phase.

The pandemic has exposed many things including inequality access for mobility. For informal workers, the pandemic was more severe than the other class.

We should also think from transport service providers and not only from the user's perspectives. They are also part of the mobility landscape and we can incorporate them by redefining the concepts of mobility and transport.

We can have a seminar for team members on the TB project and discuss linkages related to ageing.

Maheen Sultan: Regarding this service providers' perspective, we can circulate this information to people working in the school of tropical medicine and hygiene.

Dr. Shanawez: We can contact with Prof. Tom Shakespeare for this. He circulated in a public platform. We can organise a meeting with Lopita for this.

EQUIMOB virtual conference: Dr. Sobin and Dr. Lekha (together with Prof. Bailey) will organise a conference in June 2021 to invite other researchers to present papers focusing on the theme ageing, health and transport. To see reflects of their studies. We can ask people to send their paper earlier so that we can review and give feedback. We can send CFP early next year.

Improving stakeholder engagement:

Need to strengthen more so that it becomes more regular interactions and inputs from them.

Shanawez: We can launch the project work with a small programme in Dhaka. Invite some stakeholders for consultation. So we can do that when Mowri and Selim will come for second round data collection. We can also discuss the disability dimension with Lopita.

Maheen Sultan: Because of COVID-19 we can even organise online. Early next year we can organise a meeting around old age, gender with the BIGD people for larger outreach. We can also involve UDP, Gender team and Road safety team in BRAC. ActionAid can also be contacted. It's the question of bringing them.

The online meeting would also facilitate to include people in different cities like Bengaluru.

The evaluative framework:

Next year we have to build the framework.

How to improve the access to public transport. Need to visualise after data analysis. Need to focus on the user perspective as well as service provider perspectives.

Will organise one more meeting in March focussing on the framework. Will see how to transfer our data-based knowledge to action points.

Martin:

Being a member of the international standard organisation technical committee on age and ageing societies, I look at the activities they are doing. You can also look at their activities and relate to your study. They have a bunch of works around transport such multigenerational neighbourhoods. This team can also take issues similar to them that would bring a new dimension to the project outcome. They are working in different geographical areas.

It would be a nice starting point of a conversation and share ideas about the works. Can work together for improving the standard of transport, accessible transport. They are also developing age-friendly workplaces.

The meeting ended with a vote of thanks to all researchers and attendees for participation.